WEST VIRGINIA LEGISLATURE

SECOND REGULAR SESSION, 1998

ENROLLED

House Bill No. 4060

(By Delegates Staton, Trump, Underwood, Amores, Buchanan, Hunt and Rowe)

Passed March 14, 1998

In Effect Ninety Days from Passage



ENROLLED

COMMITTEE SUBSTITUTE

FOR

H. B. 4060

(By Delegates Staton, Trump, Underwood, Amores, Buchanan, Hunt and Rowe)

[Passed March 14, 1998; in effect ninety days from passage.]

AN ACT to repeal articles one and two, chapter fifty-eight of the code of West Virginia, one thousand nine hundred thirtyone, as amended; to repeal sections eight, nine, ten, eleven, twelve, thirteen, fifteen, sixteen, seventeen, eighteen, nineteen, twenty, twenty-one, twenty-two, twenty-three, twenty-four, twenty-five, twenty-six, twenty-seven, twenty-eight, twentynine and thirty-one, article five of said chapter; to amend and reenact section twenty-seven, article seven, chapter twentyone-a of said code; to amend and reenact section four, article five, chapter twenty-nine-a of said code; and to amend and reenact sections one, two, three, four, five, six, seven, fourteen and thirty, article five, chapter fifty-eight of said code, all relating generally to appellate procedure; repealing provisions of law relating to appellate relief in the supreme court of appeals which are outdated, archaic, or not in conformity with rules of appellate procedure promulgated by the supreme court of appeals; providing for appeal from circuit court in an unemployment compensation case to be made in accordance with the provisions of the state administrative procedures act; prescribing when an appeal will lie to the supreme court of appeals; providing for the certification of questions of law to the supreme court of

appeals; providing for a petition for appeal to be filed in accordance with rules of appellate procedure promulgated by the supreme court of appeals; prescribing the time for filing a petition for appeal to the supreme court of appeals; providing for the suspension of the execution of a judgment at the instance of a person desiring to present a petition for appeal; providing that a petition for appeal shall be filed and processed filed in accordance with rules of appellate procedure promulgated by the supreme court of appeals; providing that the contents of the transcript of record shall be governed by rules of appellate procedure promulgated by the supreme court of appeals; providing for an appeal to be given before an appeal takes effect; and providing for an appeal by the state of a judgment quashing an indictment.

Be it enacted by the Legislature of West Virginia:

That articles one and two, chapter fifty-eight of the code of West Virginia, one thousand nine hundred thirty-one, as amended, be repealed; that sections eight, nine, ten, eleven, twelve, thirteen, fifteen, sixteen, seventeen, eighteen, nineteen, twenty, twenty-one, twenty-two, twenty-three, twenty-four, twenty-five, twenty-six, twenty-seven, twenty-eight, twenty-nine and thirty-one, article five of said chapter be repealed; that section twenty-seven, article seven, chapter twenty-one-a of said code be amended and reenacted; that section four, article five, chapter twenty-nine-a of said code be amended and reenacted; and that sections one, two, three, four, five, six, seven, fourteen and thirty, article five, chapter fifty-eight of said code be amended and reenacted, all to read as follows:

CHAPTER 21A. UNEMPLOYMENT COMPENSATION.

ARTICLE 7. CLAIM PROCEDURE.

§21A-7-27. Appeal to supreme court of appeals.

- The judgment of the circuit court shall be final unless
- 2 reversed, vacated or modified on appeal to the supreme
- 3 court of appeals in accordance with the provisions of
- 4 section one, article six, chapter twenty-nine-a of this code.

CHAPTER 29A. STATE ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURES ACT.

ARTICLE 5. CONTESTED CASES.

5

6

19

20

21 22

23

24

25

26

§29A-5-4. Judicial review of contested cases.

- (a) Any party adversely affected by a final order or 2. decision in a contested case is entitled to judicial review 3 thereof under this chapter, but nothing in this chapter shall be deemed to prevent other means of review, redress or relief provided by law.
- (b) Proceedings for review shall be instituted by filing a petition, at the election of the petitioner, in either the 7 circuit court of Kanawha county, West Virginia or in the 9 circuit court of the county in which the petitioner or any 10 one of the petitioners resides or does business, or with the judge thereof in vacation, within thirty days after the date 11 12 upon which such party received notice of the final order 13 or decision of the agency. A copy of the petition shall be 14 served upon the agency and all other parties of record by 15 registered or certified mail. The petition shall state 16 whether the appeal is taken on questions of law or 17 questions of fact, or both. No appeal bond shall be 18 required to effect any such appeal.
 - (c) The filing of the petition shall not stay enforcement of the agency order or decision or act as a supersedeas thereto, but the agency may stay such enforcement, and the appellant, at any time after the filing of his petition, may apply to such circuit court for a stay of or supersedeas to such final order or decision. Pending the appeal, the court may grant a stay or supersedeas upon such terms as it deems proper.
- 27 (d) Within fifteen days after receipt of a copy of the 28 petition by the agency, or within such further time as the 29 court may allow, the agency shall transmit to such circuit 30 court the original or a certified copy of the entire record of the proceeding under review, including a transcript of 31 32 all testimony and all papers, motions, documents, evidence 33 and records as were before the agency, all agency staff 34 memoranda submitted in connection with the case, and a 35 statement of matters officially noted; but, by stipulation of 36 all parties to the review proceeding, the record may be shortened. The expense of preparing such record shall be 37

59

60

61

62

63

64

65

66

67

68

69

70

71

- 38 taxed as a part of the costs of the appeal. The appellant 39 shall provide security for costs satisfactory to the court. 40 Any party unreasonably refusing to stipulate to limit the 41 record may be taxed by the court for the additional costs 42 involved. Upon demand by any party to the appeal, the 43 agency shall furnish, at the cost of the party requesting 44 same, a copy of such record. In the event the complete 45 record is not filed with the court within the time provided 46 for in this section, the appellant may apply to the court to 47 have the case docketed, and the court shall order such 48 record filed.
- 49 (e) Appeals taken on questions of law, fact or both, 50 shall be heard upon assignments of error filed in the cause 51 or set out in the briefs of the appellant. Errors not argued 52 by brief may be disregarded, but the court may consider 53 and decide errors which are not assigned or argued. The 54 court or judge shall fix a date and time for the hearing on 55 the petition, but such hearing, unless by agreement of the 56 parties, shall not be held sooner than ten days after the 57 filing of the petition, and notice of such date and time 58 shall be forthwith given to the agency.
 - (f) The review shall be conducted by the court without a jury and shall be upon the record made before the agency, except that in cases of alleged irregularities in procedure before the agency, not shown in the record, testimony thereon may be taken before the court. The court may hear oral arguments and require written briefs.
 - (g) The court may affirm the order or decision of the agency or remand the case for further proceedings. It shall reverse, vacate or modify the order or decision of the agency if the substantial rights of the petitioner or petitioners have been prejudiced because of the administrative findings, inferences, conclusions, decision or order are:
- 72 (1) In violation of constitutional or statutory 73 provisions; or
- 74 (2) In excess of the statutory authority or jurisdiction of the agency; or

- 76 (3) Made upon unlawful procedures; or
- 77 (4) Affected by other error of law; or
- 78 (5) Clearly wrong in view of the reliable, probative and 79 substantial evidence on the whole record; or
- 80 (6) Arbitrary or capricious or characterized by abuse 81 of discretion or clearly unwarranted exercise of discretion.
- 82 (h) The judgment of the circuit court shall be final
- 83 unless reversed, vacated or modified on appeal to the
- supreme court of appeals of this state in accordance with 84
- 85 the provisions of section one, article six of this chapter.

CHAPTER 58. APPEAL AND ERROR.

APPELLATE RELIEF IN SUPREME COURT OF ARTICLE 5. APPEALS.

§58-5-1. When appeal lies.

- A party to a civil action may appeal to the supreme
 - 2 court of appeals from a final judgment of any circuit
 - 3 court or from an order of any circuit court constituting a
 - final judgment as to one or more but fewer than all claims
 - 5 or parties upon an express determination by the circuit
 - court that there is no just reason for delay and upon an

 - express direction for the entry of judgment as to such claims or parties. The defendant in a criminal action may
 - appeal to the supreme court of appeals from a final
- judgment of any circuit court in which there has been a 10
- 11 conviction or which affirms a conviction obtained in an
- 12 inferior court.

§58-5-2. Certification to supreme court of appeals.

- 1 Any question of law, including, but not limited to, 2 questions arising upon the sufficiency of a summons or
- return of service, upon a challenge of the sufficiency of a
- pleading or the venue of the circuit court, upon the
- 5 sufficiency of a motion for summary judgment where
- such motion is denied, or a motion for judgment on the
- pleadings, upon the jurisdiction of the circuit court of a
- person or subject matter, or upon failure to join an
- indispensable party, may, in the discretion of the circuit

10

- court in which it arises, be certified by it to the supreme 11 court of appeals for its decision, and further proceedings
- 12 in the case stayed until such question shall have been
- 13 decided and the decision thereof certified back.
- 14 procedure for processing questions certified pursuant to
- 1.5 this section shall be governed by rules of appellate
- 16 procedure promulgated by the supreme court of appeals.

§58-5-3. Presentation of petition.

- A party desiring to appeal, seeking the original
- jurisdiction of the supreme court of appeals, or seeking an
- opinion of the court on certified questions may file a
- petition in accordance with rules of appellate procedure
- promulgated by the supreme court of appeals.

§58-5-4. Time for appeal.

- No petition shall be presented for an appeal from any 1
- judgment rendered more than four months before such
- petition is filed with the clerk of the court where the
- judgment being appealed was entered: Provided, That the
- judge of the circuit court may, prior to the expiration of
- such period of four months, by order entered of record
- extend and reextend such period for such additional
- period or periods, not to exceed a total extension of two
- months, for good cause shown, if the request for
- preparation of the transcript was made by the party 10
- 11 seeking such appellate review within thirty days of the
- 12 entry of such judgment, decree or order.

§58-5-5. Stay of proceedings pending appeal; supersedeas bond; post-conviction bail.

- A petition for stay of proceedings pending appeal,
- supersedeas bond or post-conviction bail relief shall be
- filed and processed in accordance with rules of appellate
- procedure promulgated by the supreme court of appeals.

§58-5-6. Filing of petition.

- Petitions for appeal shall be filed and processed in 1
- accordance with rules of appellate procedure promulgated
- by the supreme court of appeals.

§58-5-7. Contents of transcript of record.

§58-5-14. Appeal bond generally.

When required by the court, an appeal shall not take effect until bond is given by the appellants or petitioners, 3 or one of them, or some other person, in a penalty to be 4 fixed by the court or judge by or in which the appeal is 5 allowed or entered with condition: If a supersedeas be 6 awarded, to abide by and perform the judgment and to pay to the opposite party, and to any person injured all 8 such costs and damages as they, or either of them, may 9 incur or sustain by reason of said appeal, in case such 10 judgment, or such part, be affirmed, or the appeal be dismissed, and also, to pay all damages, costs and fees, 11 12 which may be awarded against or incurred by the 13 appellant or petitioners; and if it is an appeal from a 14 judgment dissolving an injunction, or dismissing a bill of 15 injunction, with a further condition, to indemnify and save 16 harmless the surety in the injunction bond against loss or 17 damage in consequence of his suretyship; and with 18 condition when no supersedeas is awarded to pay such 19 specific damages, and such costs and fees as may be 20 awarded or incurred: Provided, That whenever an appeal 21 is awarded in any action or suit wherein a judgment for 22 the payment of money has been entered against an 23 insured in an action which is defended by an insurance 24 corporation, or other insurer, on behalf of the insured 25 under a policy of insurance, the limit of liability of which 26 is less than the amount of said judgment, execution on the 27 judgment to the extent of the policy coverage shall be 28 stayed until final determination of such appeal, and no 29 execution shall be issued, or action brought, maintained or 30 continued against such insured, insurance corporation, or 31 other insurer, for the amount of such judgment so stayed, 32 by either the injured party, the insured, or the legal 33 representative, heir or assigns of any of them, during the 34 pendency of such proceeding, provided such insurance 35 corporation, or other insurer, shall:

- 36 (1) File with the clerk of the court in which the 37 judgment was entered, a sworn statement of one of its 38 officers, describing the nature of the policy and the 39 amount of coverage thereof;
- 40 (2) Give or cause to be given by the judgment debtor 41 or some other person for him a bond in a penalty to be 42 fixed by the court or judge by or in which the appeal is 43 allowed or entered, not to exceed the amount of such 44 insurance coverage set out in the sworn statement above 45 required, with condition to pay the amount of such 46 coverage upon said judgment if the judgment or such part 47 is affirmed or the appeal is dismissed, plus interest on said 48 sum and cost;
- 49 (3) Serve a copy of such sworn statement and bond 50 upon the judgment creditor or his attorney;
- 51 (4) Deliver or mail to the insured at the latest address 52 of the insured appealing upon the records of such 53 insurance corporation, or other insurer, written notice that 54 execution on such judgment to the extent that it is not 55 covered by such insurance is not stayed in respect to the 56 insured: *Provided*, That the filing of a bond by the 57 insured or someone for him, conditioned upon the 58 payment of the balance of the judgment and interest not 59 stayed by the insured as aforesaid if the judgment is 60 affirmed or the appeal is dismissed, shall stay execution on 61 the balance of said judgment not covered by such 62 insurance: Provided, however, That the filing of such 63 statement and bond hereunder by an insurance 64 corporation or other insurer shall not thereby make such 65 insurance corporation or other insurer a party to such 66 action, either in the trial court or in the appellate court.

§58-5-30. Appeal by state of judgment quashing indictment.

Whenever in any criminal case an indictment is held bad or insufficient by the judgment of a circuit court, the state, on the application of the attorney general or the prosecuting attorney, may appeal such judgment to the supreme court of appeals. No such appeal shall be allowed unless the state presents its petition therefor to the supreme court of appeals within thirty days after the entry of such

Enr. Com. Sub. For H. B. 4060] 10

The Joint Committee on Enrolled Bills hereby certifies that the foregoing bill is correctly enrolled.
Chairman Senate Committee Chairman House Committee
Originating in the House.
Takes effect ninety days from passage.
Clerk of the Senate
Brigory M. Broy
Clerk of the House of Delegates
President of the Senate
Speaker of the House of Delegates
The within ODOLOVEO this the 1St
day of 1998.
Governor
@ GCU 326-C

PHESENTED TO THE

GOVERNOIDR.

Time 108/18m